

PLANNING SCHEME AMENDMENTS C193 AND C194
HERITAGE CONTROLS FOR 30-50 LA TROBE STREET,
MELBOURNE

7 February 2012

Presenter: David Mayes, Manager Strategic Planning

Purpose and background

1. The purpose of this report is to present the heritage assessment of an independent consultant engaged by the City of Melbourne to assess the heritage significance of four buildings located sequentially at 30-50 La Trobe Street, Melbourne (see Attachment 2) and to recommend planning scheme heritage controls.
2. The heritage assessment was prompted by a request from the Melbourne Heritage Action Group for heritage protection of the buildings.

Key issues

3. The subject buildings are within the Mixed Use Zone and are not affected by a Heritage Overlay. They were given a 'C' grading and identified as part of a level two Streetscape in the City of Melbourne's Central Activities District Study 1984 but were not included in the Heritage Overlay. They are not included in the recent Central City (Hoddle Grid) Heritage Review 2011 as they are outside the Capital City Zone.
4. The heritage assessment by John Briggs Architect Pty Ltd (Attachment 3) characterises the buildings as being demonstrative of the Victorian and Edwardian era and the mixed-use early development of this end of La Trobe Street and that they maintain a presence as a heritage streetscape with historical, representative and aesthetic significance to the City of Melbourne. The consultant has provided a statement of significance for each building and recommends that the four buildings be included in the Heritage Overlay and that the grading for one of the buildings be revised.
5. The consultant's recommendations are supported by management. The planning scheme amendments required to apply the Heritage Overlay to these buildings are as follows:
 - 5.1. Planning Scheme Amendment (C193) introduces **interim** heritage controls – a Ministerial amendment (ie. exempt from notification requirements and approved by the Minister for Planning).
 - 5.2. Planning Scheme Amendment (C194) introduces **permanent** heritage controls. The amendment, will be exhibited and any affected person and/or parties may make submissions and be heard by an independent panel (should one be appointed) through the standard process (Attachment 4).

Recommendation from management

6. That the Future Melbourne Committee:
 - 6.1. receive this report;
 - 6.2. note that management proposes to recommend the following actions to Committee on 6 March 2012:
 - 6.2.1. request that the Minister for Planning prepare and approve Melbourne Planning Scheme Amendment C193, pursuant to section 20(4) of the *Planning and Environment Act 1987*, to introduce interim heritage controls to 30-50 La Trobe Street, Melbourne; and

- 6.2.2. seek authorisation from the Minister for Planning to prepare and exhibit Planning Scheme Amendment C194, which seeks to introduce permanent heritage controls to 30-50 La Trobe Street, Melbourne; and
- 6.3 defer any further consideration to 6 March 2012 to allow for public comment on the proposal.

Attachments:

- 1. Supporting Attachment
- 2. Map of the properties affected by the proposed Heritage Overlay
- 3. Heritage Review
- 4. Process flowchart

SUPPORTING ATTACHMENT

Legal

Part 3 of the *Planning and Environment Act 1987* (“the Act”) sets out the procedure for planning scheme amendments. Division 1 of Part 3 of the Act sets out the exhibition and notice requirements of planning scheme amendments.

Section 8(1)(b) of the Act provides that the Minister for Planning may prepare amendments to any provision of a planning scheme.

Section 20(4) of the Act provides that the Minister for Planning may exempt himself or herself from the requirements of the Act which govern the normal statutory process for amending a planning scheme:

“if the Minister considers that the compliance with any of those requirements is not warranted or that the interests of Victoria or any part of Victoria make such an exemption appropriate.”

The Minister can approve an amendment to a planning scheme under Section 35 of the Act.

Finance

The costs associated with the preparation and exhibition of Amendment C194 can be met by the Strategic Planning Branch’s 2011-12 budget.

Conflict of interest

No member of Council staff, or other person engaged under a contract, involved in advising on or preparing this report has declared a direct or indirect interest in relation to the matter of the report.

Relation to Council policy

The amendment is consistent with Council’s commitment to heritage as described in the Municipal Strategic Statement (MSS). In particular, it is consistent with the objectives and the implementation strategies of Clause 21.05-1 of the Local Planning Policy Framework, by conserving places and precincts of identified cultural heritage significance.

Environmental sustainability

The retention and re-use of heritage buildings can reduce building, demolition and new construction waste and conserve the embodied energy of existing buildings.

**Planning Scheme Amendments C193 & C194 – Heritage controls over 30-50 La Trobe Street
Map of the properties affected by the proposed Heritage Overlay**



Northeast La Trobe Street, 30 to 50 La Trobe Street, Melbourne

30 - 50 La Trobe Street Melbourne

Historical associations with persons or events**Creation or major development date:**

The group of four buildings survive from the period of early development of this north eastern end of La Trobe Street from the 1870s through to 1915 with the construction of the building at 42 – 46 La Trobe Street. The properties had in some cases been first occupied with workshops, stables from 1860 with the first significant development being the surviving buildings.

Architects:

30-34 La Trobe Street:

Alfred Frederick Kursteiner

36-40 and 48-50 La Trobe Street:

John W. Roberts

Builders:

Not known

Major owners or occupiers:

30-34 La Trobe Street:

Turner Verein German Gymnastic Association (1872-1906), sold to, and occupied by Grand United Order of Odd Fellows (G.U.O.O.F.) (1907-1945), G.U.O.O.F. and various other Unions, Associations and tenants (1946). Royal Melbourne Institute of Technology (1969-?).

36-40 and 48-50 La Trobe Street:

Joseph H. Burton (& Sons) livery stables and coach factory respectively.

42-46 La Trobe Street:

In 1965 an office for a timber yard and workshop was recorded both constructed in iron. A forge was listed in 1872, a carriage factory in 1874 and Frederick Goernemonn was listed as a coach builder on the property in 1877 until 1915 when

the shops were built to be occupied by the Atlas Trading Co. manufacturing baby carriages in the western side and by Cheong, J., & Co. cabinet manufactures then Yuen Bow & Co., furniture manufactures from 1917 until 1921.

Place evaluation

Building Grading and streetscape level 1984

The 1984 evaluation of the streetscape had all four buildings graded C, with the streetscape graded Level 2
(Central Activities District Conservation Study 1984)

'C' buildings. Demonstrate the historical or social development of the local area and /or make an important aesthetic or scientific contribution. These buildings comprise a variety of styles and building types. Architecturally they are substantially intact, but where altered, it is reversible. In some instances, buildings of high individual historic, scientific or social significance may have a greater degree of alteration.

'D' buildings. These are representative of the historical, Scientific, architectural or social development of the local area. They are often reasonably intact representatives of particular periods, styles or building types. In many instances alterations will be reversible. They may also be altered examples which stand within a group of similar period, style or type or a street which retains much of its original character. Where they stand in a row or street, the collective group will provide a setting which reinforces the value of the individual buildings.

Level 2 Streetscape. These streetscapes are of significance either because they still retain the predominant character and scale of a similar period or style or because they contain individually significant buildings.

Later Reviews

The *Central City Heritage Study Review* 1993 and the Review of the Heritage Overlay Listings in the CBD 2000-2002 have not altered the gradings accorded to the subject building in the 1984 assessment.

Description and History

The group of three pleasing Victorian buildings with the support of the Edwardian shop/factory present a place that retains a predominant heritage character scale and period of building development demonstrative of the early mixed and light industrial use of the area developed beyond the initial Hoddle survey. Developed from the mid to late Victorian and into the Edwardian period the remnant group has presence as a cohesive, demonstrative and informative section of retained heritage streetscape offering appealing visual contrast to much of the surrounding streetscape developed a century later.

The initial layout of the Melbourne grid by Robert Hoddle in 1837 produced 24 rectangular blocks between Flinders Street and Lonsdale Street.¹ The first land auction was on 1 June 1837 with the second sale soon afterwards. The following sales of 1838-9 were held in Sydney and progressively disposed of land towards Spring Street with the exception of reserved land. Following a slump in land sales during the 1840s and recovery there was disruption caused by discovery of gold with collapse of the labour market. Following the gold rushes and with the enormous

1 Melbourne, The City's History and Development, Miles Lewis with Phillip Goad & Alan Mayne, 1994

population of men returning from the diggings “manufacturing industries were virtually forced into existence.”² Requiring more space in which to grow by 1861 the majority of the available land within the Hoddle grid was sold and the grid had been extended northwards to the extent of the Town Reserve established by Hoddle in 1837. Of the group of four subject properties on the northern side and east end of La Trobe Street, 48-50 La Trobe Street was the first to be shown as occupied in the rate record, and was first occupied in 1862 with a workshop constructed of iron with its use as a coach factory continuing until 1920.

Of the surviving frontages the oldest part of the group is likely to be the three ground floor arched openings of the 1868 coach factory at 48-50 La Trobe Street. Next was the Former Turn Vereine German Gymnastic Association Hall at 30–34 La Trobe Street first constructed in 1871 and extended in 1874. In 1887 the coach factory achieved its final form with the construction of the first floor and the Victorian classical freestyle facade to a design by architect John W Roberts. Three years later in 1890 a twin to the coach factory was constructed at 36-40 La Trobe Street, also owned by Joseph H. Burton, to replace the livery and bait stables he had operated on the site from 1875. At 42-46 La Trobe Street the property was partially occupied with a workshop from 1865 until the construction in 1915 of the three-storey factory for manufacture of furniture and baby carriages with a pair of shops at ground floor.

The Former Turn Vereine German Gymnastic Association Hall is a classically styled Victorian is four storeys, including an attic level and half basement, with a rendered facade to La Trobe Street. The classically decorated rendered facade is comprised of two stories of applied trabeated structural order of squared pilasters with simple Doric capitals supporting simply expressed entablatures and cornices. The dignified mid Victorian facade with simple classical order and arched windows has a suspended awning introduced c1922 at which time it is possible the attic storey was added and the windows to the half basement introduced. The sidewall to Bell Place is generally utilitarian in expression, altered over time and today present without a coherent visual appeal although it is informative of the history of alterations.

The twin buildings at 36-40 and 48-50 La Trobe Street, originally owned and occupied by Joseph H. Burton(& Sons) as livery stables and coach factory respectively and both constructed by architect John W Roberts, are double storey and were crowned with a raised and curved pediment over the central bay of the façade. At 36-40 La Trobe Street this pediment has been lost. The rendered facades are in the Victorian Classical freestyle with three bays delineated by trabeation with simple pilasters supporting an entablature with a regular array of console brackets supporting the cornice. Each bay has a pair of arched windows set within a flat arched inset to the wall plane that have keystones enlivened with head. At 48-50 La Trobe Street the ground floor three bays of applied pilasters with flat arched openings between remains whilst at 36-40 La Trobe Street the ground floor has been altered and only the remnant of the pilasters remains at the corners of the building.

At 42-46 La Trobe Street the Edwardian redbrick former factory and pair of shops has vertical emphasis with paired gables to the frontage giving an Elizabethan overtone to the otherwise simple utilitarian federation commercial building. Above the third level is a rendered cornice and render has been used for the gable copings and the ground floor with limited classical details. The fenestration of the building has been replaced and this has notably diminishing the buildings integrity. A late

² Melbourne, The City's History and Development, Miles Lewis with Phillip Goad & Alan Mayne, 1994, P 44-45.

twentieth century addition of two floors in the form of an exaggerated mansard, clad in slate tiles, considerably detracts from the early facade.

Statement of Significance

What is significant?

The small remnant section of streetscape located outside the Capital City Zone although within the expanded Hoddle Grid and within the original town reserve established in 1837, comprises three Victorian and an Edwardian building that together present to La Trobe Street as a heritage place of mixed style type and period whilst retaining much of the original mature character.

At 30-34 is a simple classical styled Victorian building of four storeys, including an attic level and half basement, which was constructed as a meeting hall for the Turner Verein German Gymnastic Association; a club that was founded in Collingwood in 1850 and amongst the earliest established in Melbourne. In 1921 it amalgamated with the Club Tivoli, today known as the Club Tivoli Deutscher Verein Melbourne Inc, or the German Club Tivoli. The building was sold in 1907 to the Grand United Order of Odd Fellows who added the entry canopy and attic storey in 1922.

At 36-40 and 48-50 La Trobe Street the matched pair in the Victorian classical free style with an applied trabeated system of pilasters, a consoled entablature at first floor and originally with curved pediments which were designed by Architect John W. Roberts for owner Joseph H. Burton. Replacing Burton's earlier buildings the extant buildings were constructed to their mature forms in 1890 and 1887 respectively, to accommodate the light industrial uses as livery & bait stables and as a coach factory. At 36-40 La Trobe Street the curved pediment and the arched openings and pilasters at ground floor have been demolished.

How is it Significant?

The streetscape comprised of the former German Gymnastic Association Hall, the former Burton Coach Factory and Livery Stables and the former federation factory and shops present historical significance (Criterion A), as a representative streetscape including the mid Victorian classical assembly building and light industrial freestyle classical Victorian and Federation freestyle buildings (Criterion D) demonstrative of the development period and pattern of the 'beyond the core' commercial and residential and civic area of the initial Hoddle grid subdivision. The section of streetscape is aesthetically significant (Criterion E) to the City of Melbourne as architecturally demonstrative of development over the period on the periphery of the initial Hoddle town survey. (The criterion used are amended from the published Heritage Victoria Criteria for applicability to heritage significance at the local level of the City of Melbourne)

Why is it significant?

Historical Significance Criterion A

The historical importance at the local level of the heritage streetscape is addressed under Criterion A: *The historical importance, association with, or relationship to, the City of Melbourne's history of the place or object.* The streetscape is demonstrative of the period and mixed-use early development of this north-eastern end of La Trobe Street. The surviving group of Victorian buildings that, along with the Edwardian neighbour, maintain a heritage presence that has been acknowledged by the longstanding level 2 grading of the streetscape. On a comparative basis if the

buildings, particularly no. 42-46, were isolated in a level 3 streetscape individually, they may not have sufficient visual presence to anchor an appreciation of the historical phase of development. However as a group the streetscape from 30-50 La Trobe Street; constructed from 1874 to 1915, establishes the phase and form of the historical development of the locality.

Representative Significance Criterion D

The subject streetscape presents good representative examples of the classical style employed prior to and at the height of the boom of the 1880s and a lesser example of the form of light industrial federation development. This aspect of the significance of the streetscape is addressed under Criterion D: *The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.* The subject streetscape on a comparative basis does not exhibit outstanding buildings or milestones in the architectural development of Melbourne. It is however a heritage streetscape of coherence and presents as a heritage place of significance in which the four individual buildings each make an important contribution. Although some alterations and additions have been made to the original mature forms of the buildings, these changes have been either been conducted with respect and regard for the buildings architectural integrity, or are reversible. Generally the alterations and additions have a limited disruptive affect upon the visual appreciation of the heritage streetscape.

Aesthetic Significance Criterion E

Where the value of the heritage place addressed under Criterion D deals with the instructive nature of the appearance and style of the buildings and streetscape, at issue here is the matter of visual appreciation. Criterion E: *The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.* The subject streetscape with classical Victorian façades supported by the less distinctive Edwardian building exhibits a coherent heritage place with presence, good design and aesthetic appeal.

Recommendation

It is recommended that the C Gradings of the Victorian buildings and the Level 2 Streetscape is appropriate for the group. Given the extent of additions and alterations to no. 42-46 La Trobe Street it is recommended that the C Grading currently attributed to that building be revised to a D Grading. Accordingly it is recommended that the group of buildings from no's 30 to 50 La Trobe Street should be added to the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay cited in Clause 43.01, *Heritage Overlay* of the *Melbourne Planning Scheme* in accordance with provisions and intent of Clause 15.03-1, *Heritage Conservation*. The section of streetscape and the associated land might be referred to as the *Northeast La Trobe Street Heritage Precinct*. As the locality of the precinct is outside the Central City Zone the proposed heritage overlay area would be subject to Clause 22.05, *Heritage Places Outside the Capital City Zone* and accordingly the Statement of Significance for the precinct would not be incorporated as would be the case if the precinct was subject to Clause 22.04.

Former Turn Verein German Gymnastic Association, now the SEFTON building. 30 to 34 La Trobe Street, Melbourne



Historical associations with persons or events

Creation or major development date:

The hall and four rooms constructed in brick and stone 1871.
1874 additions of a further six rooms and, presumably, the rendered facade.
Attic storey and entry canopy added 1922

Architect:

Kursteiner, Alfred Frederick

Builders:

Not known

30 – 34 La Trobe Street Melbourne



30 - 50 La Trobe Street Melbourne

Major owners or occupiers:

Turner Verein German Gymnastic Association (1872-1906), sold to, and occupied by Grand United Order of Odd Fellows (G.U.O.O.F.) (1907-1945), G.U.O.O.F. and various other Unions, Associations and tenants (1946). Royal Melbourne Institute of Technology (1969-?).

Place evaluation

Building Grading and streetscape level 1984

Building Grading C, Streetscape Level 2
(Central Activities District Conservation Study 1984)

'C' buildings. Demonstrate the historical or social development of the local area and /or make an important aesthetic or scientific contribution. These buildings comprise a variety of styles and building types. Architecturally they are substantially intact, but where altered, it is reversible. In some instances, buildings of high individual historic, scientific or social significance may have a greater degree of alteration.

Description and History

The classically styled Victorian is four storeys, including an attic level and half basement, and is constructed in brick and stone with a rendered facade to La Trobe Street. The classically decorated rendered facade is comprised of two stories of applied trabeated structural order of squared pilasters with simple Doric capitals supporting simply expressed entablatures and cornices. The ground floor is elevated by a half basement and is accessed by a flight of stairs at the entry. The cornice to the third level has dentils whilst that to the second level, or ground floor, is without. The wall area beyond the trabeation including the corners and attic level are expressed with deep bevelled joints representative of ashlar coursing. Projecting string courses express the ground floor as the plinth to the façade and also crown the attic floor. At ground floor is the central entry and two horizontally formatted rectangular windows that have federation styled leadlight glazing and joinery. At ground level the entry is sheltered by a suspended awning introduced c1922 at which time it is possible the attic storey was added. Within the trabeation of the second and third levels the wall area is smooth render. Window openings are arched with architraves springing from string courses embellished with floral bosses. The central highlight window above the entry is recessed into the wall plane and has a full architrave. Between the windows, the wall areas of the two levels are of primary decorative expression and have raised panels embellished with patterns impressed into the render with a template of wrought iron. Along the side wall to Bell Place at third level is a projecting string course however the side and rear of the building are generally utilitarian in expression, altered over time and today present without a coherent visual appeal.

Historically the subject land was a vacant allotment until the construction of the first Hall of the Turner Verein Association. The section of La Trobe Street in which the subject property is situated was developed initially in the same period and the buildings surviving today appear to have been the first significant buildings constructed on the land. The property, re-numbered in 1896 as no. 36-40 La Trobe Street was recorded as vacant until the construction of a brick house and livery and bait stables on that site in 1875-76 for Joseph H Burton. The property was then rated as stables until 1890 when a tender was accepted for the erection of livery stables concluded to be the existing building. The property at no. 42-44 remained vacant until 1915 and that numbered 46 was listed as a timber yard and iron workshop in 1868 followed by occupancy by Frederick Goernemonn Coachbuilder through to 1915 when the pair of shops were built. The property now no. 48-50 was recorded as Burton Jos. H. Coachbuilder in 1868 when the building now on the land was constructed. With the 1915 building accommodating manufactures of baby carriages and Chinese furniture manufactures the area remained predominantly of light industry through until the mid 20th Century. The group of buildings developed from the mid Victorian period, supported by the late Edwardian altered pair of shops,

present as a cohesive section of the La Trobe Street streetscape with a predominant heritage character.

Statement of Significance

What is significant?

In 1874, Architect Alfred Fredrick Kursteiner designed additions to the German Gymnastic Association Hall that had been constructed in 1871. The design of the initial hall has been attributed to the architect William George Wolf although records suggest he had not yet arrived in Australia at that time. The building was constructed and occupied by the Turner Verein German Gymnastic Association; a club that was founded in Collingwood in 1850 and by 1885 had more than 600 members. The club was amongst the earliest established in Melbourne and in 1921 it amalgamated with the Club Tivoli, today known as the Club Tivoli Deutcher Verein Melbourne Inc, or the German Club Tivoli. The building was sold in 1907 to the Grand United Order of Odd Fellows who added the entry canopy and attic storey in 1922.

The subject property and the three accompanying properties that together present as a group of heritage buildings are located outside the Capital City Zone although the locality is within the Hoddle Grid. As it now exists the building contributes to the La Trobe Street streetscape as a simple classical styled Victorian building of commercial or public use, having some latter alterations including an attic storey, the entry canopy and Federation styled leadlight windows to the ground floor.

The sidewall to the Bell Place laneway and rear of the building presents as a mix of original and altered elements that are not primary to the appreciation of the building's heritage contribution to the La Trobe Street streetscape.

How is it Significant?

The former German Gymnastic Association Hall building contributes to the significance of the streetscape historically (Criterion A), as a representative mid Victorian classical assembly building (Criterion D), and aesthetically (Criterion E) to the City of Melbourne as architecturally demonstrative of the period and pattern of its development. (The criterion used are amended from the published Heritage Victoria Criteria for applicability to heritage significance at the local level of the City of Melbourne)

Why is it significant?

Historical Significance Criterion A

The historical importance at the local level of the former Turner Verein German Gymnastic Association is addressed under Criterion A: *The historical importance, association with, or relationship to, the City of Melbourne's history of the place or object.* The Building is demonstrative of the period and mixed-use early development of this north-eastern end of La Trobe Street. The subject building contributes to the surviving group of Victorian buildings that, along with the Edwardian neighbour, maintain a heritage presence that has been acknowledged by the longstanding level 2 grading of the streetscape. On a comparative basis if this was an isolated Victorian building in a level 3 streetscape it may not have sufficient visual presence to anchor an appreciation of the historical phase of development, however in the company of the neighbouring Victorian buildings at no's 36-40 and 48-50 La Trobe Street; constructed (1875 and 1868 respectively) as well as the 1915 Edwardian at no. 42-

46 La Trobe Street, the phase and form of the historical development of the locality is established by the group.

Representative Significance Criterion D

The subject building is a sound representative of the classical style employed prior to the boom of the 1880s. This aspect of the significance of the property is addressed under Criterion D: *The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.* The subject building on a comparative basis is not an outstanding building or a milestone in the architectural development of Melbourne, it is however one that within the context of its heritage streetscape makes an important contribution. Although alterations and additions have been made to the original form, these changes have been conducted with respect and regard for the building's architectural integrity, the alterations complement its heritage value and have no disruptive affect upon the visual appreciation of the heritage streetscape.

Aesthetic Significance Criterion E

Where the heritage value addressed under Criterion D deals with the instructive nature of the appearance and style of the building, at issue here is the matter of visual appreciation. Criterion E: *The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.* The subject classical Victorian façade to four stories high has a pleasing if unremarkable classical composition that has been undiminished by alterations respectfully conducted. The building exhibits good design and aesthetic appeal.

Recommendation

It is recommended that the C Grading and the Level 2 Streetscape is appropriate. Accordingly it is recommended that this building, in association with the buildings to no. 50 La Trobe Street should be added to the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay cited in Clause 43.01, *Heritage Overlay* of the *Melbourne Planning Scheme* in accordance with Clause 15.03-1, *Heritage Conservation*.

Former Burton Livery & Bait Stables, 36 - 40 La Trobe Street, Melbourne



36 – 40 La Trobe Street Melbourne

Historical associations with persons or events

Creation or major development

date: A tender was accepted in 1890 for the erection of livery stables. This building replaced a brick house and stables first constructed in 1875 then rated as stables with additions constructed in 1882.

Architect: J. W. Roberts & Co undertook additions to stables in 1882 and the 1890 erection of livery stables for Joseph H. Burton & Sons

Builders: Not known



30 - 50 La Trobe Street Melbourne

Major owners or occupiers:

Joseph H. Burton

Place evaluation

Building Grading and streetscape level 1984

Building Grading C, Streetscape Level 2
(Central Activities District Conservation Study 1984)

'C' buildings. Demonstrate the historical or social development of the local area and /or make an important aesthetic or scientific contribution. These buildings comprise a variety of styles and building types. Architecturally they are substantially intact, but where altered, it is reversible. In some instances, buildings of high individual historic, scientific or social significance may have a greater degree of alteration.

Description and History

In 1890 at the end of the decade of boom in Melbourne the double storey rendered brick façade is likely to have been constructed in front, or in place, of the stables first constructed on the site in 1875. The design of the façade by Architect John W. Roberts for Joseph H Burton matches the façade, also by Roberts and owned by Burton, two doors to the west that was completed with the addition of the first floor three years earlier in 1897. At the first floor level the Victorian Classical freestyle detailing survives at the subject building and is essentially identical to the detail found at no. 48-50 La Trobe Street. At the subject property the arched pediment has been demolished down to the parapet and at ground floor only the pilasters at the corners survive with those flanking the central bay as well as the arched openings having been stripped away to provide modern shopfronts.

At first floor the three bays are delineated by trabeation with simple pilasters supporting an entablature with a regular array of console brackets that support the cornice. Each bay has a pair of arched windows set within a flat arched inset to the wall plane that have keystones enlivened with head. Within the flat arch is a spandrel panel above the paired arched windows that have architraves to the arches springing from pilasters. The pilaster piers are set upon the sill which is expressed as a stringcourse running behind the primary pilasters of the first floor. The sill is then expressed as supported on a bracket below the each of the window piers. The composition is exuberant and appealing.

Historically the subject land was recorded as vacant ground in 1874. In 1875 a brick house and stabling was recorded following with brick stabling recorded in the ensuing years. Joseph H. Burton was the owner, becoming Burton and Sons in 1886. The subject property was operated by Burton as livery and bait stables offering stabling, feed and possibly care for the horses of travellers and visitors to Melbourne or its residents. Associated with the livery stables the Burtons had also been coach building at the property now no. 48-50 La Trobe Street from 1862. The section of La Trobe Street in which the subject property is situated was developed initially in the same period and the buildings surviving today appear to have been the first significant buildings constructed on the land. The abutting property at no. 42-44 remained without a building until 1915 and that now numbered 46 was listed as a timber yard and iron workshop in 1868 followed by occupancy by Frederick Goernemonn Coachbuilder through to 1915 when the pair of shops were built. With the 1915 building accommodating manufactures of baby carriages and Chinese furniture manufactures the area remained predominantly of light industry through until the mid 20th Century. The group of three Victorian buildings, supported by the late Edwardian altered pair of shops, present as a cohesive section of the La Trobe Street streetscape with a predominant heritage character.

Statement of Significance

What is significant?

In 1890 the Architect John W. Roberts called for tenders for the erection of livery stables, a use that Joseph H. Burton had made of the property since 1875. The building was erected as a matched pair to that two doors to the east, which was designed by Roberts for Burtons coach building factory. These buildings are Victorian in the classical free style with an applied trabeated system of pilasters and with a consoled entablature at first floor. At the subject site the curved pediment has been removed and the ground floor altered to modern shopfronts.

The subject property and the three accompanying properties that together present as a group of heritage buildings are located outside the Capital City Zone although the locality is within the Hoddle Grid. The two Burton buildings with the former Turn Verein Hall of 1871 and the altered 1915 building survive as a significant heritage streetscape.

How is it Significant?

The former Burton Livery Stables contributes to the heritage significance of the streetscape historically (Criterion A), as a representative freestyle classical Victorian commercial building (Criterion D), and aesthetically (Criterion E) to the City of Melbourne as architecturally demonstrative of the period and pattern of its development. (The criterion used are amended from the published Heritage Victoria Criteria for applicability to heritage significance at the local level of the City of Melbourne)

Why is it significant?

Historical Significance Criterion A

The historical importance at the local level of the former Burton Livery Stables is addressed under Criterion A: *The historical importance, association with, or relationship to, the City of Melbourne's history of the place or object.* The Building is demonstrative of the period and mixed-use early development of this north-eastern end of La Trobe Street. The subject building contributes to the surviving group of Victorian buildings that with the Edwardian neighbour maintain a heritage presence that has been acknowledged by the longstanding level 2 grading of the streetscape. On a comparative basis if this was an isolated Victorian building in a level 3 streetscape, particularly with its missing pediment, it may not have sufficient visual presence to anchor an appreciation of the historical phase of development. However in the streetscape context with the neighbouring Victorian Hall and Edwardian, and particularly given its design matching that of 48-50 La Trobe Street, constructed three years earlier by the same architect and owner, the former stables demonstrates the phase and form of the historical development of the locality and is an makes an important contribution to establishing the coherence and presence of the heritage streetscape.

Representative Significance Criterion D

The subject building is representative of the classical freestyle employed during the boom of the 1880s. This aspect of the significance of the property is addressed under Criterion D: *The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.* The subject building on a comparative basis is not an outstanding building or a milestone in the architectural development of Melbourne, it is however one that within the context of its heritage streetscape makes an important contribution. The loss of the curved pediment is a reversible alteration, given the existence of the building's twin at no. 48-50 La Trobe Street. The changes to the ground level are also reversible although are adaptations to the current building use.

Aesthetic Significance Criterion E

Where the heritage value addressed under Criterion D deals with the instructive nature of the appearance and style of the building at issue here is the matter of visual appreciation. Criterion E: *The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or*

unusual integration of features. The subject double storey classical freestyle Victorian façade continues to be a pleasing, if altered composition of visual interest and exuberance diminished by loss of the pediment and to a lesser degree the changes to the ground level. The building exhibits the basis of good design and aesthetic appeal and makes an important contribution to the appreciation of its pair and to the coherence of the streetscape.

Recommendation

It is recommended that the C Grading and the Level 2 Streetscape is appropriate. Accordingly it is recommended that this building, in association with the buildings to no. 50 La Trobe Street should be added to the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay cited in Clause 43.01, *Heritage Overlay* of the *Melbourne Planning Scheme* in accordance with Clause 15.03-1, *Heritage Conservation*.

It is recommended that with any significant development proposal for the site that the lost pediment be reconstructed to match that at no. 48-50 La Trobe Street and that consideration be given to reconstructing the ground floor frontage.

42 to 46 La Trobe Street, Melbourne



42 – 46 La Trobe Street Melbourne

Historical associations with persons or events

Creation or major development date: The property was partially occupied with a workshop from 1865 until the construction in 1915 of the existing building altered with late 20th C additions

Architect: Not known

Builders: Not known

Major owners or occupiers: The property now no's 42-44 had no rate entries prior to 1915 when two shops were recorded as being built. At no. 46 La Trobe Street in 1965 an iron office for a timber yard and iron workshop was recorded. A forge was listed in 1872, a carriage factory in 1874 and Frederick Goernemonn was listed as a coach builder on the property in 1877 until 1915 when the shops were built to be occupied by the Atlas Trading Co. manufacturing baby carriages in the western side and by Cheong, J., & Co. cabinet manufactures then Yuen Bow & Co., furniture manufactures from 1917 until 1921. The Red Cross Society then occupied the building until 1958.



30 - 50 La Trobe Street Melbourne

Place evaluation

Building Grading and streetscape level 1984

Building Grading C, Streetscape Level 2
(Central Activities District Conservation Study 1984)

'C' buildings. Demonstrate the historical or social development of the local area and /or make an important aesthetic or scientific contribution. These buildings comprise a variety of styles and building types. Architecturally they are substantially intact, but where altered, it is reversible. In some instances, buildings of high individual historic, scientific or social significance may have a greater degree of alteration.

Given the dominant additions to the building and the replacement of windows with contemporary glazing it is now recommended that the building better fits the definition of a D Grading in the Level 2 Streetscape that retain much of its original character.

'D' buildings are representative of the historical, scientific, architectural or social development of the local area. They are often reasonably intact representatives of particular periods, styles or building types. In many instances alterations will be reversible. They may also be altered examples which stand within a group of similar period, style or type or a street which retains much of its original character. Where they stand in a row or street, the collective group will provide a setting which reinforces the value of the individual buildings.

Description and History

The original three storey red brick pair of shops and factories with a vertical emphasis has paired gables to the frontage giving the building an Elizabethan overtone to the otherwise simple utilitarian federation commercial building. Above the third level is a rendered cornice and render has been used for the gable copings and the ground floor with limited classical details. The fenestration of the building has been replaced and this has notably diminished the building's integrity. A late twentieth century addition of two floors in the form of an exaggerated mansard, clad in slate tiles, considerably detracts from the early facade.

Historically the subject land was lightly occupied with workshops and a forge presumably in single storey sheds with an access way down the centre of the site and central cross over¹ until the subject building was constructed 1915. The section of La Trobe Street in which the subject property is situated was lightly occupied from the 1860s with the Former Turner Verein Hall first constructed in 1871 with additions in 1874. The buildings surviving from today from no. 30 – 50 La Trobe Street appear to have been the first significant buildings constructed on the properties. The properties either side of the subject site where owned by Joseph H. Burton and Sons and the pair of matching buildings in the Victorian classical freestyle accommodated coach building on the west side and livery stables on the east. This pair of double storey buildings came to their completed form in 1887 and 1890 respectively. With the 1915 building accommodating manufactures of baby carriages and Chinese furniture manufactures the area remained predominantly of light industry through until the mid 20th Century. The group of three Victorian buildings, supported by the late Edwardian altered pair of shops, present as a cohesive section of the La Trobe Street streetscape with a predominant heritage character.

Statement of Significance

What is significant?

The three storey utilitarian federation freestyle building in face brick with limited rendered features, vertical expression and gables giving an Elizabethan overtone, was constructed in 1915. The surviving frontage as it presents to La Trobe Street contributes to the small section of street that retains much of its original character.

The subject property and the three accompanying properties that together present as a group of heritage buildings are located outside the Capital City Zone although within the expanded Hoddle Grid and within the original town reserve established in 1837.

How is it Significant?

The frontage of the subject building makes a contribution to the historical, and architectural significance of the heritage streetscape and group of buildings from no. 30-50 La Trobe Street. Although later in construction than its neighbours it is however the first significant building on its site and representative of the period and pattern of the development of the northern fringe of the grid within town reserve towards the Victoria Street boundary.

Why is it significant?

Historical Significance Criterion A

The contribution at the local level of the former factory and shops is addressed under Criterion A: *The historical importance, association with, or relationship to, the City of Melbourne's history of the place or object.* The Building is demonstrative of the period and mixed-use early development of this north-eastern end of La Trobe Street. The subject building contributes to the surviving group of early buildings that maintain a heritage presence that has been acknowledged by the longstanding level 2 grading of the streetscape. On a comparative basis if this were an isolated building in a level 3 streetscape the prominence of the additions and alterations to the windows have diminished the original character and presence of the building to a degree that it would not generally be appreciated as an individual heritage place. However in the company of the neighbouring Victorian buildings at no's 30-34, 36-40 and 48-50 La Trobe Street; constructed (1875, 1890 and 1887 respectively) the subject Edwardian contributes to the demonstration, by the streetscape, of the phase and form of the historical development of the locality.

Representative Significance Criterion D

The subject building is a utilitarian representative of the federation freestyle without attribution to a known designer. The building does however contribute to the significance of the heritage streetscape under Criterion D: *The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.* The subject building on a comparative basis was not originally an outstanding building or a milestone in the architectural development of Melbourne and with its additions and alterations has diminished visual appeal. It is however a building that within the context of its heritage streetscape makes a constructive contribution and has value beyond its individual worth.

Aesthetic Significance Criterion E

Where the heritage value addressed under Criterion D deals with the instructive nature of the appearance and style of the building at issue there is the matter of visual appreciation. Criterion E: *The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.* The extent of the additions and alterations including sand blasting of the brick work as diminished the visual appeal and perception of the integrity of the building such that it could no longer be considered to have significance under this criterion individually. However as a contributory element in the streetscape the building maintains the cohesive heritage character from no. 30 to 50 La Trobe Street. The building makes a contribution to the significance of the streetscape under this criterion.

Recommendation

It is recommended that the C Grading currently attributed to the building be revised to a D Grading in the Level 2 Streetscape. Accordingly it is recommended that this building, in association with the building from no. 30 to 50 La Trobe Street should be added to the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay cited in Clause 43.01, *Heritage Overlay* of the *Melbourne Planning Scheme* in accordance with Clause 15.03-1, *Heritage Conservation*.

¹ MMBW detail plan No. 1021, 1895

Former Burton Coach Factory, 48 to 50 La Trobe Street, Melbourne



48 – 50 La Trobe Street Melbourne

Historical associations with persons or events

Creation or major development date: Tenders were called for an additional storey to a coach factory in 1887. An iron workshop was recorded in 1860 to become a brick and iron coach factory in 1868.

Architect: John W. Roberts

Builders: Not known



30 - 50 La Trobe Street Melbourne

Major owners or occupiers:

Joseph H. Burton from 1862
Joseph H. Burton and Sons from 1868
J.H. and H. Burton 1897-1920
Rocke, W. H. & Co. Pty Ltd. furniture manufactures 1921 - 1932
Central Mission Girls Club 1933
Turnbull Bros, paper merchants 1934 – ??

Place evaluation

Building Grading and streetscape level 1984

Building Grading C, Streetscape Level 2
(Central Activities District Conservation Study 1984)

'C' buildings. Demonstrate the historical or social development of the local area and /or make an important aesthetic or scientific contribution. These buildings comprise a variety of styles and building types. Architecturally they are substantially intact, but where altered, it is reversible. In some instances, buildings of high individual historic, scientific or social significance may have a greater degree of alteration.

Description and History

In 1887 towards the height of Melbourne's boom architect John W. Roberts, on behalf of Joseph H Burton and Sons, called tenders for an additional storey to a coach factory. The existing coach factory had existed from 1868 when it was first recorded as a brick and iron building prior to which since 1860 only an iron coach factory was recorded on the property.

Given the description of the works in Argus it can be concluded that the ground floor with its three arches is likely to have existed from 1868 and that Roberts added the first floor and the rendered expression to the existing stables. Roberts had five years earlier undertaken extensions to the Burtons livery stables at no. 36-40 La Trobe Street and in 1890 accepted tenders for the replication of the subject façade for use as livery stables at the other Burton property.

Crowning the subject façade is a raised and curved pediment over the central bay of the façade. The pediment is comprised of a pair of piers from which springs the curved cornice supported on regularly spaced consol brackets. On the outer side of the piers are a pair of scrolled and ornamented brackets. At the first floor level the Victorian Classical freestyle detailing is matched by the detail found at no. 36-40 La Trobe Street. The three bays are delineated by trabeation with simple pilasters supporting an entablature with a regular array of console brackets supporting the cornice. Each bay has a pair of arched windows set within a flat arched inset to the wall plane that have keystones enlivened with head. Within the flat arch is a spandrel panel above the paired arched windows that have architraves to the arches springing from pilasters. The pilaster piers are set upon ground floor cornice. This is a slightly different arrangement than that found at the twin building at no. 38-40 La Trobe Street where the whole façade is understood to have been constructed in one, slightly later building campaign.

At ground floor each of the three bays is a flat arched opening set in the wall behind and between the applied trabeated structural representation. The ground floor windows in the two eastern bays and the entry are not original joinery. The composition is exuberant and appealing.

Historically the subject land was recorded as vacant until 1862 when the entry; Burton Jos. H., coach builders, was made in the rates record. In the ensuing years. Joseph H. Burton was the owner, becoming Burton and Sons in 1868. The subject property was occupied by Burton as a coach building factory until 1920. At the property now no. 36-40 La Trobe Street, the Burtons also owned and operated livery and bait stables offering stabling, feed and possibly care for the horses of travellers and visitors to Melbourne or its residents up until 1923. The section of La Trobe Street in which the subject property is situated was developed initially in the same period and the buildings surviving today appear to have been the first significant buildings constructed on the land. The abutting property at no. 42-44 remained without a building until 1915 and that now numbered 46 was listed as a timber yard and iron workshop in 1868 followed by occupancy by Frederick Goernemonn

Coachbuilder through to 1915 when the pair of shops were built. With the 1915 building accommodating manufactures of baby carriages and Chinese furniture manufactures the area remained predominantly of light industry through until the mid 20th Century. The group of three Victorian buildings, supported by the late Edwardian altered pair of shops, present as a cohesive section of the La Trobe Street streetscape with a predominant heritage character.

Statement of Significance

What is significant?

In 1887 the Architect John W. Roberts called for tenders for the construction of an additions level to the 1868 brick and iron coach factory owned and operated by Joseph H. Burton. The building was erected as the first of what latter become a matched pair of Burton's buildings and enterprises that continued until the 1920s. The coach factory and matching livery stables are Victorian in the classical free style with an applied trabeated system of pilasters and with a consoled entablature at first floor. At the subject site the curved pediment survives as do the arched openings and pilasters at ground floor although the original ground floor joinery has been replaced.

The subject property and the three accompanying properties that together present as a group of heritage buildings are located outside the Capital City Zone although the locality is within the expanded Hoddle Grid. The two Burton buildings with the former Turn Verein Hall of 1871 and the altered 1915 building survive as a significant heritage streetscape.

How is it Significant?

The former Burton Coach Factory contributes to the heritage significance of the streetscape historically (Criterion A), as a representative freestyle classical Victorian commercial building (Criterion D), and aesthetically (Criterion E) to the City of Melbourne as architecturally demonstrative of the period and pattern of its development. (The criterion used are amended from the published Heritage Victoria Criteria for applicability to heritage significance at the local level of the City of Melbourne)

Why is it significant?

Historical Significance Criterion A

The historical importance at the local level of the former Burton Coach Factory is addressed under Criterion A: *The historical importance, association with, or relationship to, the City of Melbourne's history of the place or object.* The Building is demonstrative of the period and mixed-use early development of this north-eastern end of La Trobe Street. The subject building contributes to the surviving group of Victorian buildings that with the Edwardian neighbour maintain a heritage presence that has been acknowledged by the longstanding level 2 grading of the streetscape. On a comparative basis the building is unlikely to be considered a milestone, or outstanding, in the architectural development of Melbourne although it is important in establishing the early phase of the development of the locale area. In the streetscape context with the neighbouring Victorian Hall and Edwardian building, and particularly given its design matching that of the former stables at 36-40 La Trobe Street, constructed three years latter by the same architect and owner, the former workshop demonstrates the phase and form of the historical development of the locality and makes an important contribution to establishing the coherence and presence of the heritage streetscape.

Representative Significance Criterion D

The subject building is a representative of the classical freestyle employed during the boom of the 1880s. This aspect of the significance of the property is addressed under Criterion D: *The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.* The subject building on a comparative basis is not an outstanding building or a milestone in the architectural development of Melbourne, it is however one that within the context of its heritage streetscape makes an important contribution.

Aesthetic Significance Criterion E

Where the heritage value addressed under Criterion D deals with the instructive nature of the appearance and style of the building at issue here is the matter of visual appreciation. Criterion E: *The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.* The subject double storey classical freestyle Victorian façade presents a pleasing composition of visual interest and exuberance. The building exhibits the good design and aesthetic appeal and makes an important contribution to the appreciation of its pair and to the coherence of the streetscape.

Recommendation

The C Grading and the Level 2 Streetscape is appropriate. Accordingly it is recommended that this building, in association with the buildings to no. 50 La Trobe Street should be added to the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay cited in Clause 43.01, *Heritage Overlay of the Melbourne Planning Scheme* in accordance with Clause 15.03-1, *Heritage Conservation*.

PROCESS – PLANNING SCHEME AMENDMENTS

